

PUBLIC INFORMATION MEETING

January 31, 2007

Legion Park Community Center

**Landscaping Improvement Project along Biscayne Boulevard from NE 67th Street to NE 87th Street
Miami-Dade County, Florida
FM# 405641-2**

The above mentioned Public Involvement Meeting was recorded and this is the transcription prepared by Marta Rodriguez, Public Information Specialist:

Marta Rodriguez:

Good evening and welcome to this Public Information Meeting for the proposed Landscaping Improvement Project along Biscayne Boulevard from NE 67th Street to NE 87th Street by the Florida Department of Transportation, District 6. I am Marta Rodriguez-Trudeau, Public Information Specialist for the design phase of this project with the consulting firm Bermello Ajamil & Partner. Before I introduce the team, I like to acknowledge City of Miami Commissioner Marc Sarnoff from District 2 and also the Community Relations Liaison from District 2, Mr. Bert Gonzalez. We have also here tonight Mr. Jose Gonzalez from the City of Miami Public Works Department and Officer Nichole from the City of Miami, Maria Mascareña from the Upper East Side NET Office and Alyce Robertson, Community Image Director from Miami-Dade County. Is there any elected officials tonight that I have not mentioned, please raise your hand. The purpose of this meeting is to provide you with information about the project and address any concerns or question that you may have. The project team members here tonight are: From the Florida Department of Transportation, District 6: Steven Craig James, Landscape Architect and Project Manager; Brian Rick, District 6 Public Outreach and Media Specialist; Elizabeth Perez, District 6 Public Involvement Coordinator for Environmental Management, Susan Travis and Catherine Owens also from the Environmental Management Office. From the consulting firm PBS&J we have here tonight Harry Belton and Jason Keese and representing the consulting firm K&S is Mr. Kirk Hoosac. From the Public Involvement consulting firm, Bermello Ajamil & Partners we have Angela Marino and myself. At the door we handed speaker cards. If anyone would like to speak during the meeting, please raise your hand and I will collect the speaker card from you and at the part during the meeting when we call on the speakers, you will be called. Also we have tables around the room with the plans of the project that if you want to look at and write your comments at any point in the plan where you feel you have concerns, you may do so and if you do, write your name and telephone number after your comment in case that the Project Manager would like to contact you, he will be able to do so. We also want to ask you that if you come up to speak, you limit your statement to two minutes. And now I will leave you with the Project Manager, Steven Craig James.

Craig:

The landscape design project that you see this evening is a result of a long public involvement process that started with the roadway public involvement for numerous other sections along Biscayne Blvd. Several of

the design elements that you will hear about tonight have been already addressed in previous public involvement meetings for the roadway project, such as the tree relocation and sidewalk treatment were already discussed and decided upon during the roadway project public involvement process. The plans that you see tonight, are specifically for the landscaping that will go in these segments. One of the unique characteristic of this segment 67 to 87 is the fact that the right of way or the roadway is very narrow. Out of all the reconstruction projects that are currently underway up to 123rd Street, this segment has the most narrow roadway. That is a significant issue and a characteristic that governs a lot of the design that you see presented tonight and it affected the roadway design as well. What that interprets basically is that the landscaping is very limited in this segment. Unfortunately, we have very limited opportunities to have landscaping in here because we just don't have a lot of space. I am going to remind you all that years ago when the public involvement occurred for the roadway project, FDOT in conjunction with its design partners, City of Miami, specifically, we did propose a landscape median in the center, many years ago, which was a continuous landscape median. There may have been a couple of access points at major intersections but generally speaking, it would have been a very long continuous landscape median. During that public involvement process the business' owners in that corridor specifically informed us that they were not happy with that design, that they did not want the access to their businesses closed by the continuing landscape media as a result, the landscape median was removed out of the plans and is now a scrambled lane. Therefore, this project no longer includes the landscape median. In just emphasizing the previous point, that the right of way is very narrow and without a landscape median we have very limited opportunities to put landscape in the segment. I just wanted to make sure that you are all well aware of that and why you see the plans in the table tonight with very few trees, very difficult to get a lot. One of the important points I would like to emphasize tonight regarding the decorative sidewalk treatment that you see presented here on the boards, it is only a concept at this point. We will like to make sure that the public is aware that we are considering other types of decorative treatments, whether decorative sidewalks treatments, decorative lighting, some of the other received from some of the citizens were for items such as trash receptacle, benches, etc. Typically the Florida Department of Transportation does not include these types of treatments unless the local communities are going to find these types of treatment under capital improvement first of all, but not only capital improvement cost but the maintenance cost of the decorative treatment must be agreed to by other agencies other than DOT. DOT will not maintain those decorative treatments. Therefore in order for those treatments to be incorporated we will have to have a maintenance agreement in place. So again, I would like to emphasize that at this point, these are some ideas that we are presenting to you all but I have a feeling that they will not be included in this project because of at this time we do not have identified maintenance funds to maintain this type of treatment. But at least we show you all that we are listening to your request. We have received requests to do decorative treatments to the sidewalk but until we resolve the issue of who is going to pay for that continuous cost of maintenance, we cannot go ahead and build that as well as others like the trash receptacle, benches. This type of thing cannot be installed unless we have an agreement from a local agency for maintenance. With that I will turn over to our landscape architect designer of records, Harry Belton who will give you more detail information regarding the specific elements of the landscape project that you see here tonight and then, we will turn it over for questions and comments.

Harry Belton:

Good evening. As Craig discussed, I want to be very clear also that this is the segment from 67 to north that that is all we are addressing tonight and showing tonight. The other thing is, all the roadway improvements are not a part of this project, either of the driveway curb line, street lights, all of that is part of the roadway project that ended up for construction and is not part of this design effort either. We are responsible for taking that given and providing as much landscaping as possible with the boundaries of right of way if we can. As Craig said earlier, we have restrictions in this particular section of Biscayne Blvd. There is a narrow right of way and in some areas there is only about 6 feet of sidewalk on either side. We also have a lot of utilities in the corridor which is crammed into this narrow right of way. We also have a lot of cross streets that are entering right of way and when you have cross streets entering right of way you must have good visibility so when you enter Biscayne Blvd. you don't get hit by a car. Plus we have a lot of driveways for the businesses in the corridor. So we have a lot of restrictions on the landscaping there. Now, we have different sections designated within the corridor, official designations of the corridor. At the time when the roadway section was been planned, there wasn't a historic district as part of Biscayne Blvd. Now there is. There is the official MiMo Historic District of Biscayne Boulevard. It goes from 77 Street to the end of our project. So when we took a look at that we also took a look at the kind of restrictions that we said already and redirected from the previous plans and discussed in group meetings that were done 3 or 4 years ago as to what the landscaping should be without the redeveloped corridor. What we know from that previous set of meetings that there will be an emphasis placed on providing more shade in the corridor for increase pedestrian use. So we tried to put as many shade trees as possible so that we can meet that decision as part of the previous planning. If you look at the landscape plans you'll see the different sections of the right of way as we have designated it at this time. Allow me to say that the design will change most likely as the process goes along. The southern section is within the historic district and that is where we had proposed a special treatment. To recognize this, we are still working with different parties to see if that is acceptable. Right now, we have no commitment in that direction. Then we have the section around 79 Street from the bridge to 81 Street. This is a very restrictive area with lots of utilities, lots of areas dedicated to traffic movements and so therefore, there is no opportunities for landscaping within that area and if you look now, there is no landscaping within that area for the same reason, there is just no place to put it. And then, from 82 south to 82 north we are continuing at the very standard street grates, using tree grates, canopy trees, to provide a state of the street concept on that area to the north that is outside of the historic district. We are maximizing again a great amount of shade proposed within the right of way of that district. Where there are areas for Royal palms we definitely have considered putting Royal palms back because we want to put them where we can so they are included as part of the plan. We really tried to do as much as we could with this corridor that is why we went ahead out of our ways to propose this "MiMo-deco" paving. You can come up and look at it. The reason why we went this way, we considered what our concept was, what our approach was, and we are very excited about it and proceeded that way with hope. Right now that is all that we were going to do in this priority now. Talk a little about ADA, the issue with the six foot sidewalk. There is another restriction here, ADA. Americans with Disabilities Act requires that we have at least six foot of clear passage without any disruptions so that you can have plenty of access for disables on both directions. Because the sidewalk in this area are very narrow, that also precludes the amount of trees we can have in the sidewalk because it will be obstructive in that requirement. Of course the way we did plans include ADA ramps and we made sure we didn't interfere with ADA ramps or crosswalk requirements.

Craig:

One thing I mentioned regarding that landscape meeting I mentioned before, my understanding is that the geometry of the sidewalk will still allow the addition of a landscape median if the community so choose. Putting that back in, we leave up to you. Funding may be a bit of an issue on how we can fund something like that but I want to let you all know that you hear a lot of talk about limitations on landscaping at least I want to give you that little bit of possible hope. I prefer to open this up to the comments and answer section before I take any questions.

Bob Powers:

The medians were turned down because they did not want to walk ten blocks to get to their house. This is not a highway like it is up in Miami Shores, it is a neighborhood. The median would divide the Blvd. into east and west giving it a bad stigma. Secondly, you did away with all the parking in the street. With median, people would have had to drive 10 blocks to turn back around and get into their neighborhoods which made absolutely no sense.

Jena-Paul Melito:

Thanks Marta. There are two minutes but there is a bit of information that was listed as inaudible on the December 14 Minutes so, I will request at least 4 minutes. My name is Jean-Paul Melito and I am from 600 NE 36 St. in Miami. For inclusion to the minutes and possible addition to the December 14 Minutes this is the information I read, listed as inaudible. I've collected 98 signatures including 16 local Boulevard business owners and operators all in support of Biscayne Blvd historic landscape and the petition reads: In the name of preservation, we the undersigned request your assistance in preserving Biscayne Boulevard as Miami's panoramic gateway, and by the way, this petition was submitted to Commissioner Marc Sarnoff. concurrent with the Capital Improvements Project and planned Historic MiMo District at that time, we would like Biscayne Boulevard decade's old landscape restored. Biscayne Blvd. has been a defining symbol of Miami for generations and we very much like preserving this role for generations to come. We are creating this petition in order to show our support and make City officials consider the importance of the historic preservation of Biscayne Boulevard. The local businesses listed in our petition are: Vagabond Hotel, Meduhr Day Spa, Café Le Glacier, Mr. B. Custom Taylor, Furniture Formula, KOBE, Danny's Printer, Jimmy's Diner, Hiho Batik, Uva 69, Starbuck's, Kingdom, Minar, Boulevard Bistro, Glo Inc., and Palm Realty, South Florida.

More so, our City's Ordinance requires Royals up Biscayne Blvd. In section SD 9, section 609.3.2 (1) paragraph one, Along Biscayne Boulevard, the pedestrian open space and the ground floor frontage shall so be designed, improved and located to provide an attractively landscaping appearance using Royal palms and other types of tropical plants suitable to its gateway role.

I think I can hand this to you. Thank you.

I am slightly dissatisfied with the landscape plan overall in Biscayne Blvd. and also up here in this area especially when you come into Miami City limits. Right now you come from beautiful Miami Shores

kind of to a stinking Boulevard. As of today, over 130 Royal palms have been removed from Biscayne Boulevard north of 38 St., up to this area and it continues. I think the reasons are two-fold; number one is removal of these Royal palms for shade. We all need shade and anyone that walks around during summer or all year round like I do, appreciate the shade. However keep in mind that the planting samples and this shade will be 20 years away and any significant shade possibly 30 years away, keeping in mind, that is, if we don't have a hurricane come through, reap up the trees and leave a landscape which is disfigure . Also hurricane stability, the Royal palms that sit there are native to south Florida. Against a lot of discussion, they are natives to the place, and they are naturally aero dynamic and prevent future situations where we had a couple of months after last hurricane where limbs were fallen down. One limb fell on a car and trapped someone for a couple of hours and almost killed him. I would like you guys to consider restoration of our landscape based on two things, one is hurricane stability and two is preservation. Really the issue at hand is coming up as whether or not the palm trees here on Biscayne Boulevard in every site are eighty years old because eighty years ago our Mayor and City Manger planted Royal palms and dedicated Biscayne Boulevard to the Veterans of all wars. They may be 10, 20, 30 years or eight years old. The fact that matters is that for 80 years Biscayne Blvd. has been filled by Royal palms and Biscayne Boulevard and Royal palms are iconic symbols of our city's pride and our city's history as a sub tropic metropolis of the southern United States. Biscayne Boulevard restored should be as beautiful as Arthur Godffrey Road in Miami Beach. In the Neighborhood NET's page, I just want to point out as well in closing, that it states on the whole page of our Neighborhood NET site, Biscayne Blvd. is the essential backbone of this neighborhood. A true Miami landmark is a beautiful and nationally famous highway is a grand avenue accentuated in Royal palms. So when you all go out on a limp to beautify other districts, I would appreciate if you went out in a limp and consider planting more Royal palms back in this gateway landscape.

Henry Patel:

(Inaudible) I agree with the comments Sean made. (Inaudible) what is the point of covering up the front of the buildings by planting shade trees. When hurricanes come, you can see debris all over the place. Those trees are the ones that take down the electric lines. Secondly, when you look at the sidewalk cafes, who is going to do the clean up of the leaves? Third is the median issue. I agree with not having the median.. In case of an emergency, for instance if a fire truck has to go across the street in case of emergency. I would like to see better landscaping and in regards to 88 Street. I want to know if once the sidewalk is removed they would lose the grandfathering status. Craig answered: I so not think it was an issue of grandfathering but that it had to do with whatever the current ADA requirements are. Henry Patel said: we are now compromising landscape for ADA . Craig said: You are getting into a lot of detail. Henry Patel said: The Commissioner is here and we appreciate his presence. I want to ask about the historic designation. I want to have a workshop with some people that are well educated on the subject. I am very open minded and like to work as in a democracy but a lot of people have no clue. They don't know where we are going and they are stuck. There is no money available and no bank will lend them money. The historic designation status is very important to solve this.

Mr. Elvis Cruz

They had probably about eight years worth of FDOT meetings on the construction phase of this project and at those meetings we would repeatedly asked, what about landscaping? We were always told, no, no, no, these meetings are only about construction they are not about landscaping. We'll have a landscaping meeting later on. And so what happened? They designed a construction project without allowing for landscaping so now, we are painted into a corner in some of these issues and what is more, the landscaping meeting came up and you already have the plans made. You have not taken public input and you have already the plans made for the southern half and the northern half, you said 90% submittal of them. You should have had all this public input before you drew up the plans but that didn't happen. I only get two minutes but I can be here for 20 minutes so I prepared a detailed analysis of the difference between a royal palm and the oaks in this application. I'll be submitting it, I got extra copies. There is a controversy here tonight, as I am sure that you are gathering. There is the royal palm people and there is the oak people and I am in support of the once with Royal palms and I have extra copies for those of you that really want oaks, please take a copy, I'll give you as many as I have, you may not change your mind, I know it is hard for people to change their minds once they've stated a position, but at least you'll see where we are coming from. At least you'll understand why we feel the way we do. How many people walked here tonight? I got two, Bob Powers lives pretty much across the street on 66 and Henry, you live what? About another block up, 72nd, good for you Henry, so you walked six blocks. This thing about people walking up and down the boulevard is, I know the people in this room, I recognize their faces, none of them are lazy. It is about time. It is not about shade, there is plenty of shade out there tonight, it's about time and that is why people don't walk to places. So the idea of putting in all these shade trees to encourage people to walk, unless you can figure out how to give them time, they are probably not going to walk. History, very briefly: This is a blue star royal highway designated after WW II to the veterans. It was also designated back on '26 for the veterans of all wars. The boulevards' Royal palms were planted at that time, is their trademark. Trademark sequeles into the MiMo District. We have three different layers of historic designation on the Biscayne Blvd. and the MiMo District is all about MiMo architecture and that tropical tourism feel and the royal palm compliments that whole concept. It is a trademark, they are trying to sell a product. These gentlemen here that own the businesses on the boulevard, they are on the front lines. This is their most important issue. It is their economical survival and they feel that the royals will give them a much better opportunity at economic viability because it is better visibility for their businesses and their signage and it promotes the whole tropical tourism ambiance that they thrive on. There are sable palms in the plans. I don't remember anybody, whether you are the royal palm fanatic or the oak fanatic wanting sable palms. Please, even if the oaks win, don't put in sable palms. They don't match anything. It's the state tree of South Carolina. Lastly, as Jean-Paul Melito mentioned, we have a law called SD 9 that requires Royal palms and other tropical plants. Oak tree is not a tropical plant it is a temperate plant. It grows in the State of Virginia. Funny how sometimes SD 9 will be enforced and other times it wouldn't. It is very selective. Please, enforce SD 9 which requires Royal palms. May I say, we should have gotten a variance the way Coral Way did, the way Old Cutler Road did, and the way South Miami Ave. did and South Bayshore Drive did to allow us to keep the Royal palms. I hope that we can get some sort of variance or scenic transportation corridor status to bring them back. Thank you.

Marta Rodriguez recognized Florida House of Representative, District 108, Representative Ronald A. Brise and he also completed a speaker card. Representative Brise, would you like to come to the microphone.

Rep. Brise:

Good evening. I come to hear sort of what is going on. I've talked to few of the residents from the area and what I want to get on record is that I want to know everything that is going on in terms of this corridor. It falls within my district. So, as information is going through from the residents to the Department of Transportation I want to be aware and I want to be aware as to the specific timeline because I know this project has been going on forever, people have been losing money forever, in terms of businesses, in terms of mobility around the area. It is a serious problem for a lot of residents. So therefore, all I ask is to have access to all the information that has transpired between the residents and the Department to see that we find a resolution quickly and a resolution that keeps the integrity of the area. And for the residents, my information will be available and I am going to have help and fight to make sure that we recover. So, I think somebody from the Department, Rick has my card and I hope to work with Rick to find a resolution to this quickly. Alright?

Erick Silverman

Thank you. This area is a special area, the MiMo designation, the awareness that is happening here in Miami, in the United States and really across the world. We have a tremendous turn out during Art Basel. A lot of people come to the area and they loved it. We are going to see a lot more of that. It is a wonderful place to work. It has great neighborhoods and there is a lot of interest. We appreciate everybody turning out tonight. Recently, we started having meetings every Tuesday, every other Tuesday, that Don Worth and Terry Demico were kind enough to organize for many of us to support the MiMo area. We appreciate their effort and their inputs. And the first thing in our first meetings was we had speakers coming in Nancy Liberman who is been about Ocean Drive at the resurrection of South Beach and we were kind enough to have a presentation of the sidewalk, of the proposed sidewalk and it was pretty well. The vast majority of the group, about 25 of us, that support the sidewalk design. It is really something that is going to give the area a sense of a neighborhood. It is going to be very special, so I recommend that we all try and support this sidewalk project. The second thing that I'd like to mention is that I am also in favor of the palms. I walked up to the area between 96 and 123rd and I walked throughout with my landscaper and asked him, how long is it going to take these trees to get mature? He said we might be walking around with walkers before these things get mature and I have to tell you, its going to cover up a lot of the wonderful architecture that we are trying to protect and in my opinion, it does not have anything to do with Biscayne Blvd. Biscayne Blvd. to me is Royal palms. I didn't know the history of the 1926 that they were dedicated to the army and I think that those are the things that make it special, that we learn about our area, we learn to embrace our area and protect those things. Many of us remember the old great days of the Playboy Club and those things were here and we'll like to see that come back. The last point, is the street lights. I strongly support changing the street light to something more similar to what we are seeing at the Performing Art Center and that we've also seen at Lincoln Road. To get Victorian street lights in the MiMo District is really working against our sense of a neighborhood, what we are trying to accomplish. Modern street lights will go better with the architecture, they will enhance the area, and they will make it feel more like the community and the neighborhood and give the people a feeling of safety. I know that is going to be a complex issue to get the street lights, to maintain them, over the long run but this is our only change to try to do it. We are going to need support, not only from our commissioner but from other people that have knowledge, but doing it, will be one of the greatest

additions that we could do to the MiMo District. So, thank you very much for your time and support the MiMo neighborhood.

Person from audience:

Are we having workshops? Erick Silverman replied: Yes, we need to have workshops for TDRs, on how to get grants. Many of the owners here speak of how its getting impossible to get financing for this neighborhood. I doubt that domain is going to go up, I doubt that (inaudible) is going to go up, I doubt that any of these lots that have plans are going to go up, most likely it is not going to be that 12 stories condominium but more 3 to 5 stories with retail kind of space. Right now condos in Biscayne Blvd. is a dead issue and there is no bank that is going to finance it. We don't know if we are getting gridlocked, but it is just getting too coincidental that there is no financing and unfortunately been an enterprise zone or an empowerment zone was taken away from this area. If we were an empowerment zone, the banks would be obligated to make investments into this neighborhood to create jobs, the jobs needed in Little Haiti and that some of those things but unfortunately, that was taken away from us and since it was taken away, there has been very little financing and lots of business owners can't afford to make the changes and they don't want to come into the neighborhood knowing that they don't have the financing set up. Thank you.

Bob Powers

My name is Bob Power and I am with the Palm Grove Association. Our neighborhood goes from 54 all the way to 77 Street road and we are trying to think a little bit out of the box. The problem that I am noticing here is, really has nothing to do with you guys. You did what you were assigned to do, you really worked. Is that there is a definite breakdown between FDOT in Tallahassee , the City of Miami and the property owners that abut Biscayne Blvd. because, I am going to tell you something, most of the trees that you guys are taking out, share a portion of the private property as well as the City's, when you go in the sidewalks and you walk up the Boulevard, like I walk the Boulevard, like right over here there is a restaurant called Kingdom, that is right on Biscayne Blvd., those Royal palms are half on the property of the owner of the building and on the City's property. The other thing is that there is this conversation out there that this is a highway. Now, in Tallahassee, it might be when they look at the map they may say this is a highway but it is not, it is a main street in a very interesting, unique neighborhood. I would say is like Grand Ave. in Coconut Grove, similar in a way because Grand Ave. is a wide Avenue that used to carry the traffic in and out of Coconut Grove, then bring it around and sent it up to Brickell Avenue. So, I am saying that this has not been treated that way. It has nothing to do with you guys in design but as far as FDOT is concerned and all the rest of that, none of that was addressed, like this is a lot of your sidewalk area specially up at 76 Street, there is a bus stop there. The sidewalk has always been 4 feet wide. In the new plans, you don't move the bus stop, but the sidewalk still only 6 feet wide thus, making the whole reason for doing a lot of this move because you can't get around it with a wheel chair. And I watched the guys try to get around it with walkers (from the back: there is not enough room). So I think that there was a lack of all this parties getting together to decide how they were going to address this issue. And, the Royal palms need to come back. I watched them take them off and stack them right over here off of SR836. I was incensed...you got the call from me, didn't you, I couldn't believe that they had stacked those Royal palms over there for two weeks, just incensed. Those are \$3,000 to \$5,000 plants and left out there just to be stacked, hold and behold that they ended going over to Watson Island but two thirds will die, whatever, I just couldn't believe it. As far as money is concerned, there is plenty of money out there

to do all this stuff and I know it has nothing to do with you guys but I felt like I need it to say that in a public forum and if I didn't laughed about it, I would really want to reap some heads off because is just so ridiculous, ridiculous to even try to sell to us, the people who live here, that it is going to take 18 months or a year and a half to finish this; it is absurd. A year and a half of reaped-up streets for 18 months. When you think about it, 18 months to do 10 blocks?? They took 10 months to do 30 blocks and they are still not finished and it looks like crap, they have 22 feet of cement further south, now I know that is not where you guys worked, but I think that the next time that you guys do this undertakings, 'cause I know how the State works, I know they always hire the same people, over and over again, you may want to look at the fact that you need to take into account what the neighborhood is, not what the State think it is but really what is the neighborhood. And I don't think that they did you justice because I know that you guys are wonderful designers because I have seen other of your private work so I know that you have it in you. I just think that they didn't give you enough. I don't think there was enough, I don't think there was enough public input . I know the last time I was here four or five years ago we talked about the medians and they wanted to get rid of the median because nobody wants to walk ten blocks up to get into our neighborhood and the other thing that I will say is that for those of us who like the parking on the street, which is a traffic calming device, you took all the parking in the street away on Biscayne Blvd. which is still a 30 mph zone up there and I don't know why they did away with the parking, but they did away with the parking in front of Michi's and a couple of other places, anyway it just forces the parking into the neighborhood and I don't think they should have done that. Anyway, thank you.

Alyce Robertson

First part not taped. Oak tree.... So shall we say Elvis, they are temperate yes, they are also per Virginia but they are native of South Florida. One of the things about retail sales that we addressed in the Strategic Master Plan is that resent studies have fed that the areas around the country where there are trees that shade, retail sales are higher than in those areas where there are no shades. And I'll also say, as far as when the trees are going to grow to a mature height that the best time to buy a tree was 20 years ago the next best time is today. On a personal thing, I didn't walk here tonight not because of the shade issue at all, I didn't walked here tonight because I have gainful employment and so I didn't really wanted to be mistaken for a playgirl tonight on the way to the meeting this evening. I didn't feel that shade is an important element to walk or not in our community. I've been a resident of Morningside since 1984 and I believe that this is an important element of how we interact those neighborhood with the Boulevard and I would like to walk more along the Boulevard once its more walkable, I would do that more often.

David Treece

Thank you. I have several comments and one question you may be able to answer. (Inaudible). There has been a great of public input throughout this whole process, including the construction all the meetings that we have had, in fact the people of FDOT has said, there were more meetings on this section of the Boulevard than any other and is all well documented and as it was pointed out in the December meeting this plan got a lot of support; it's a mixture of palms and shade trees typical in a pedestrian area that shade trees are there.. There is a whole landscape median of Royal palms and other areas that have Royal palms. The way people are talking that there are no Royal palms as part of this plan and that is not true. I understand that you may want more, that is possible, but that was the consensus, and as it was also pointed

out, and I was glad to hear this, every other neighborhood, as part of this project, has felt the same. We are no different. The vast majority of people say, we love our canopies, we want shade trees but of course we want a balanced mix, we don't want it to look like some place up north, we want palm trees whether is Royal palms, or sable palms or whatever kind of palms. Sometimes is frustrating, it seems like if you put in one kind of palm, they want another kind of palm so, with that thought, I want to recognize that this has gotten a lot of support and that it has had a lot of public input that doesn't mean that there is not room for any other comments and that is where my question is going to come in. I realized that we have our City commissioner here because we obviously have gotten a lot of support from the City on all sorts of things, the MiMo Districts, whether is grants for the businesses. It seems like we do need to have, since there is insufficient landscaping due to the limitations, particularly in the northern part that we may need to do things on our own that was not part of the scope, that was actually my question; I'll ask that question if you can answer it. Are there alternatives? We can have trees because its too narrow or the sidelines for traffic safety. Are there other alternatives? And then again, I don't know if its swale or adding more space, or if that is something that we can try to get grants for afterwards, separately, or are there any other opportunities to add more landscaping; or is it a budget limitation that we need to lobby for money (inaudible) have been widely supportive, even the MIMO design and many things that we may have to add afterwards that are special projects in agreement with the City

Commissioner Sarnoff asked if he could speak and took the microphone.

Commissioner Sarnoff:

When I heard about this issue the first thing I tried to do is research to find out exactly where we were and what happened. Apparently in 2003 the former commissioner passed a resolution that said that zoning had met with the community and every side who supports the proposal for continuous canopy of shade trees along the corridor and they addressed particularly having shade trees, which is I take it, the oak trees. When I got involved I looked at the sidewalks I had in mind sight that I was going to see a lot of shade trees and barely any sidewalk. When I got to see the plans themselves, and I learned that there are approximately five or six blocks, depending on how you like to count them, that don't have any trees, four blocks which has one tree, three blocks which have two trees and the trees will be as you know 12 foot when they are installed, and unless I am mistaken, an oak trees grows at a rate and pace of less than six inches a year so, I think in thirty years you will probably have a shade tree. But the point is, you are not going to have trees on the better part of nine blocks. What you are going to have is what I call Ray-Ban favorite dream which is people needing sun glasses as you have a great deal of wide sidewalk. The reason you have that is because FDOT has treated this as a brand new roadway. They have decided that the angles do not allow for trees. Now, I think there were great many well intended people when they decided that they were going to try to create, in their own mind's eyes, an image, an entirely shaded Biscayne Blvd. And what did they end up are 75 less trees, or there abouts. I spend the better part of today and the better part of two days ago with FDOT trying to convince them along with an engineer that we should be treated differently, that we shouldn't treat this Boulevard like it is a brand new boulevard. That we do as was done, as Elvis Cruz mentioned, in a number of other places, treated as a historic or at least, a beautiful corridor, and now they are listening, and what they are going to do is they are going to walk each street and they are going to try to put trees back on. You are 75 trees less than when you started. I have some bad news for you, most of those trees, Bob you are right, I visited those trees today. Most of the

trees that were taken out are essentially dead, the Royal palms. You have over a million dollars in your budget for trees, you have plenty of money for trees, that is not your issue. Your issue right now is the angles. Your issue right now is the reality of the situation, and that is, getting engineers, and I mean this respectfully, not disrespectfully, getting engineers to allow you to put trees in what they call sidelines, which is, when they believe is going to harm or could potentially harm or become a safety issue, they don't want to put a tree there. That resulted in one block losing eight palm trees, another block losing six trees, and just guess what your net was there...zero. So, what started out like a great idea and a great plan you now have a pretty blank slate. So what I suggest you do, I am working with Mary Conway and we are also working with FDOT and we are going to try to walk each sideline. Whether you put in a royal palm or whether you put in an oak tree, you all need green because right now you have six blocks with nothing and you really have nine blocks with very little. You didn't get anything that you intended to get and they are not going to bend over and say, the hell with the sidelines, that is not who FDOT is. But we have to try to get them to treat us like this is not a new roadway, like this was a beautiful historic roadway. I think that there is going to have to be a compromise somewhere in there and they seemed very inevitable in a meeting that we had today. So, I don't know if you all have ever seen this, but FDOT sent out an interesting proposition for NE 15th Street to NE 35th Terrace and not to be Salomon, it has palm trees and oak trees lined up and down. You know folks, I was a palm tree person, that is not to say I am right or not to say I am wrong, I'd like to be known as the tree commissioner, I'd like to be known as the guy that plants trees, and I want to make sure that we get back as many of the 75 trees that are lost. What you call them and what goes in there, I would tell you what I would do is let them decide block by block, site by site, we'll allow a royal palm here whereas an oak tree you may not because of the canopy it provides. And let them do it that way, let them literally do it that way. Because I don't think the intention here was to lose the amount of trees that you lost, I hope it is not. These discussions are ongoing because we could not come up with on a plan or a sketch basis doing this without them going out there with their angular eyes and putting up the necessary trees. I still have hopes too that they'll actually put up the exact amount of trees, but FDOT they are engineers and engineers do things based on safety. So, if anybody wants to see the resolution, I have it with me, and if anybody want to see what was passed out, in September of 2006, this is what they sent out and I did send a letter out to Senator Margolis in January of this year, January 5th, asking her to treat FDOT as a historic, scenic corridor. Unfortunately I think the way she responded was in a newspaper article. So, I think the best thing to do at this point is literally, Bob the good news is you are not really dealing with Tallahassee, you are dealing with FDOT district 6, and while you may not think Tallahassee has a heart, FDOT district 6 is a pretty good place to work and they got the message today very clearly, and this is very important to this community that they don't lose trees but that they have a net gain of trees. What those trees are at this point in the game, I strongly urge you and I ask you and I recommend you, let the sideline decide what goes in there. If it is going to be something that a royal palm will be allowed in because it is less obtrusive, let it be the royal palm. Obviously we are talking about these trees at this point, it is going to be sided trees, that means that they have to be as narrow as possible just to get back to where they took the others out. You are going to lose some trees, I know of three trees that cannot go back in because they turned the curve in a more drastic angle. But that is where you are and I learned more than I care to know about angles and I learned as much as I need to know about FDOT for Biscayne and I also learned that when you have something worth preserving, that you have to preserve it before you let them get into it, and we should have called and we should have declared this a historic corridor before we allowed them to take down these trees, but unfortunately, if I could change time, I wouldn't be standing here right now, I'd be much more important. So I leave it to you

guys, it is up to you, I mean I'd like to continue to work with FDOT, I'd like to see about these angles, and I expect most of what you are going to have to get on these six blocks that don't have trees, on the three blocks that have two trees, and I have news for you, when you have three trees on a block and they are saplings, that is not a lot of canopy for a lot and lot of years, and I suggest to you, it may never be canopy, and to leave you with one last thought, you may want to rethink just how wide you make your sidewalks because your trees are not going to be the trees you expected and you may put some greenery and break up that wide sidewalk because what was in somebody's mind's eye it is probably never going to make it to the building construction phase. Take a good close look at those diagrams and look where you are getting a lot of trees, and ask yourself, even there, is that what you want, because you are not going to have any break in the sidewalk, it is going to be an expensive wide glare. So, that is what I know, if anybody has a question, they want to direct me to do something other than what I think is the right thing to do which is dealing with this as we have it right now, not dealing with this as we maybe should have back in June of 2006, where I take it even back earlier than that. I am not saying anybody here was malicious, I think what you had was a bunch of people who thought through something and didn't expect the angles to be so severe and to be so restrictive. You know none of us or most of us in this room are probably not engineers and while I heard about the angles I didn't know and I suspect those people didn't know that this was going to be treated as a brand new roadway.

David Treece: I just want to ask a question about what you just mentioned, I mean about more green, if it is not part of this, like all that unbroken sidewalk, isn't that going to be more up to the City that up to FDOT?

Commissioner Sranoff: No, FDOT is putting on the sidewalks

David Treece: But I mean, if it is not a tree is there something we can get in that stretch of unbroken sidewalk?

Commissioner Sarnoff: No. FDOT will not allow the City to go in and put a tree unless the angle is satisfactory to FDOT. FDOT will decide the angles.

David Treece: So if there is no tree there, that was my question, are there alternatives like swales, grassy swales. But then who does that?

Commissioner Sarnoff: Yes. This is the time to decide as to what you want for your sidewalks and that is why I recommend to think this through because, I mean, I am not going to profess to be an expert but if you want a two or three foot strip of grass or you want a low bush, and I am suspecting that you don't work for FDOT because of the angles, now is the time to decide, they have not pour the sidewalks. I just caution you, do you really want a complete stretch, of in some places 10 or 12 or 14 feet, I think, but you do have right now as much as 14 feet in some places of sidewalk. Now is the time, if you want to contact my office, contact my office I am going to ask you to do CMiro@miamigov.com tell me where you are, tell me exactly what you want. I suspect you can get without damaging sidelines of bush, I am sure you can get, and again, I am think that you are going to have to act with one voice at this point, I don't think that this is going to be an individual thing, you may want, very simply put grass, you may want a break that wide sidewalk

From audience: Wouldn't we have an issue with irrigation if we have grass?

Commissioner Sarnoff: I suspect that you are right. They are not putting in irrigation. You will have to water it yourselves.

From audience: Wouldn't it be wise to have some sort of financial grant. The sidewalk, we can't do nothing with the sidewalk. Lets say on my property line if I want to put palm trees, the only option is to do it inside my property line. But if you have more trees inside your property line that somehow solves

the purpose of having more landscaping because there is no room on the sidewalk. You can say ok, can we consider a good code where we can have palm trees or whatever by the sidewalk inside our property lines.

Commissioner Sarnoff: I don't know that anybody is telling you what to do inside your property line.

Someone else from the audience: What he is trying to say is if the you would paid for it

From audience: Yes that is exactly, as a property owner, I want to know if there are grants to put a fountain because at the end of the day, we are trying to get the same objective as everybody, how can we have more landscaping? Sidewalk is not an issue because then we have lawsuits of ADA, accidents and other lawsuits so you can't do that. So I am looking at a real estate approach and solution to this problem.

Commissioner Sarnoff: FDOT will not give you a grant for personal property, City of Miami will not give you a grant for personal property.

From audience: I think that if you are a historic scenic highway there are grants

Commissioner Sarnoff: No, you are dealing with, remember they are only going to put in what the angles will allow and what we are trying to do is bend their angles, we are trying to say, don't use these three levels of angles; one will be a historic designation, one will be a repair of the road, and you unfortunately are coming in under the new construction definition. We are trying to get them to number 2 and if we are really good, we will get them to number one but they seem very resistant to number one. So you guys need to form a consensus and get back to me in my office and let me know , just on the sidewalk issue, what exactly you can do. Now there is something called TREEMENDOUS. If you contact TREEMENDOUS they do give out trees to private citizens and I can give you a telephone number for that. They also have a tree program for Miami-Dade County.

Craig: On the sidewalk issue if you want to mark up the plans and indicate where you would like to make changes

Sarnoff: If you want to contact somebody from TREEMENTDOUS the number is 786-423-5094.

Steven Craig James: I would like to caution you all tonight that changes in the sidewalk design that you are talking about are not decorative treatment like we are presenting here, you are now discussing changes in the design of the sidewalk itself, now this is just superficial treatment that you are seeing her tonight . Changes in geometry, now that are changes to the roadway plans that are starting construction now. So we are speaking about two different projects here and two different way to approach these changes.

Sarnoff: I am pretty confident that we can work together if these folks decide that they want to put a patch of green in the sidewalk on the swale that we can do that. You know better than me but I'll be surprise based in the meeting I had today that we could not make some change like that.

Craig: Absolutely, I agree. I am just trying to direct you that that is in another project, it is not in the project that we are presenting tonight. Changes absolutely can be considered, that is not what I am saying. I am just trying to guide you, if you want to make changes to the sidewalk geometry that is not necessarily what you are seeing here tonight.

Sarnoff: You are using the work geometry and to me it is just a matter of cutting off a section of the sidewalk on the swale that will allow for a green space. If that is geometry then I stand corrected.

From the audience: You guys are just going to go ahead and pour the concrete and then cut it out where you planned on putting trees?

Craig: That is correct.

From the audience: Now how do those trees get watered?

Craig: These trees at these particular locations will not have irrigation, they will have one year warranty establishment period. The contractor would warranty that approximately after one year they will be established and after that we would have to talk about potential follow-up

From the Audience: Well I saw these trees along 36 Street and some of them are dead already and they were just planted.

Treese: Isn't there suppose to be an agreement between FDOT, the City and the County?

Sarnoff: The City is responsible for taking care of the trees. That is the dangerous thing.

You see those beautiful jobs they've done in midtown Miami, absolutely stunning landscaping and its all irrigated. I know that that has nothing to do with FDOT, that is a private company working with the City (talk to the CAR) I can't understand what watcher gets a landscape designer that would be designing any of this without having any type of irrigation provided to the trees. I just don't get that, I don't understand

Sarnoff: They should have been irrigated and they should have had enough (inaudible)

From the audience: Like Arthur Godfrey Road. But you guys didn't look into this neighborhood like that.

Craig : That is not true. The issue with irrigation is the cost of maintenance. Everyone here tonight in this room understand that trees need irrigation. That is not what we are debating here. The issue is the cost of maintenance of irrigation is very expensive and until the community is willing to take on that expense I can clearly tell you tonight that FDOT will not maintain irrigation statewide.

Rollason:

You know the responsible thing to do is what we've done in other places in the City. Its that you put the underground in and you just stub it off. Therefore, we don't have to tear off the road again. Then we can go back to the pvc pipes that are there, you know, you are not (inaudible) my man, you don't want to listen, you want us to say what we have to say and shut up and when we start to say something you don't like, you turn your head and you got all these looks on your face. You are here to public input baby, whether you like it or not, so listen to what we have to say , and we bring these things up and then you say, oh we are more than willing to do this, but you know what, it is not been done, and what we'll do is, just as stupid as what is happening there right now, at the cost of what we are paying for concrete out of our tax dollars, you are going to pour all that concrete and then go back and cut it all out where the trees go. We are going to pay for the labor to cut off the concrete that the taxpayer is paying for at about \$125.00 a yard and you all think that is the way to do it because the construction people and the landscape people can't get together and decide how to do it, so the construction people say, the hell we'll pour the concrete and you come back and chop it off and do whatever you do and if it is not that way, there is no way that the pipes are going to get in there because you don't even know where the holes are going to be. So, I am sorry that we upset you with the issues that we bring but it is pretty poorly coordinated among the FDOT people themselves. And in the City of Miami when I was an Assistant City Manager in Public Works, we just put out a ruling saying, you know what, you don't do any work in any of these medians, any more Public Works project, without putting in the pvc for lights and the pvc for water. And we did that in areas, and you know what, in a couple of years the community came and say, we would like to pay for the water and hook up irrigation and down by Fair Isle, they came and they put the electric in and the Homeowners Association is paying for the electric dub light. But what would it had been have we not just laid those pipes. We put the pipes down on McFarland, now it is not done yet, but they are there, where McFarland doesn't have to get torn up if they come back and say, you know, we want to pay for this or

that. That to me is what makes sense and that is something that FDOT should include as part of their basic design. But these pipes have to go in. Because you know damn well that after the moratorium is over and people want to come in and irrigate and put in lighting, we are going to start tearing up the Boulevard. So it ought to be there now and it ought to be part of what we do as just a matter of course.

Craig: The section south of here do have pipes put on the ground. Where the local agencies would agree and sign a maintenance agreement, pipes are put in the ground and in this particular section here tonight, the maintenance agreement was not executed, no one would sign a maintenance agreement. Therefore, no pipes are put into the ground. All of these issues were addressed during the roadway design process .

Rollanson: There is no maintenance to put in a pvc and you cap it off and it sits in the ground. What is the worst that is going to happen five years from now if we going to get into it and is destroyed. That is not your fault. I agree with you in the maintenance, it can't be hooked up, it can't be used until there is a maintenance agreement but when we finally get to that point if the neighborhood decides to do it, if the City decides to do it, wouldn't it be better if those pipes were sitting in the ground, already there. What does it cost to throw pvc in the ground?

Craig: They are very expensive. This segment right here that we brought up tonight, I believe the pvc cost over \$300,000.00 just for the sleeving alone. Sleeving is a very expensive material pvc that has gone up in price along with the cost of concrete and other building materials. PVC has gone up significantly in cost and the cost of those sleeves are significant and it was not determined to be feasible to put in those sleeves and endure that cost without a maintenance agreement signed because then the Department would be put in a position that sleeves would be put in the ground with no maintenance agreement, with no assurance that that cost will ever be tapped or used at a later date. If there was a maintenance agreement we would have put in sleeving in the ground. These issues were addressed during the design process of the roadway.

Treece: Is it too late to get a maintenance agreement, is it too late to do this now.

Craig: Along with the other sidewalk geometry that I spoke about earlier, I would encourage you all to bring that up to the Department's attention, that is work that would have to be done during the roadway work like it is being done now in the segment right here. There is conduit been put in for landscape lighting in this segment. There is conduit that are already in the ground, now, out here in Biscayne Blvd. in this segment. So, it is a little bit late but you certainly can approach the Department with this request.

Sarnoff: I will go to Gus Pego, that is who you have to go to? I'll go to Gus Pego tomorrow and I'll see if by going to the City we can get a maintenance agreement very quickly established. Are there any other questions?

From the audience; The street lights, is there any chance for us to do anything about the street lights at this point now?

Sarnoff: I got to tell you, that again was chosen

From the audience: Did they get purchased?

Sarnoff: No you are right, and I will raise that as well, but just so you know, apparently you guys met and you agreed earlier, I don't know when this meeting took place, took place the better part of two years ago, and apparently you agreed on a certain design. I have to agree with you, I am not the taste police, but I don't know that something like that design goes with what you are trying to achieve in the MiMo District.

From the audience; That is what was done further up and we just followed the design all the way down. If not, there were other options available.

Sarnoff: Apparently this was the design chosen sometime ago

Treese: The option was the cobra head light and this old other lighting so this was a victory at the time and now things can be done better.

Sarnoff: Let me just ask about lighting before I go to this. Who favors the Victorian lights?

Lady from the audience: As oppose to what? To the traditional cobra head light? Yes I prefer the Victorian.

Person from the Audience: As opposed to the lights thy have by the Performing Art Center and Lincoln Road.

Sarnoff: See it is one thing to replace light with light I don't know what they cost but lets just say I am buying a Volkswagen, I may be able to get a Toyota. I don't think I can go and buy a Volkswagen and they say, hey you know what, the Mercedes looks good.

Form the audience: Se what the alternatives are.

Sarnoff: Well, I will do my best. And I'll tell you what, before I make a choice for you, I try to convene a meeting as to show you what the options are. I encourage everybody (inaudible) as soon as you come here and you say oh I prefer Victorian, no, I like the modern, no, lets just leave it the regular.

From the audience: Well you didn't get a clarion call for the Victorian.

Sarnoff: No I didn't get a resounding, I heard one. And that is to say that this is a large enough group of people to make that choice. Let's do this, let's see about getting an agreement and let see if we can change the light. I think that you are looking for something more modern, right?

Lady from the audience: Just so that it wouldn't clash because this is so modern and Victorian looks so....

Sarnoff: Well let me choose it, I love clothing so I can do this thing.

From the audience: Even just the regular silver street lights 100 time better than the Victorian.

Sarnoff: I will do my best to give you the three choices in the categories of what that would cost and I hope that we can do something. They'll tell me what we can and can't do at this late date. But I'll get on this thing first thing tomorrow.

Henry: I don't mean to bombard with a lot of things but some where down the road I would like to have a workshop on the preservation benefits or something because we need to have some support on what avenues are available for tax cuts because I went to Dade County with my property taxes

Sarnoff: I don't want to do this, I don't want to do this here. I know what you want, but most folks are here for trees, landscaping, maybe lights, but I hear what you are saying and actually I am addressing what you are saying. It is not like it is not been addressed in my office.

Henry: I am not saying that, I am just reminding you.

From the audience: May I speak?

Sarnoff: I'd say one other place I have to go tonight that is why I want to make sure that I trip.

Person from the audience:

I am a property owner. My wife and I are at 7751 NE Bayshore corridor. We've also helped organized this breakfast group that meets every two weeks on Biscayne Blvd to really discuss issues to make Biscayne Blvd a better place and if you are interested in getting in the email list, please contact me afterwards. We had two meetings, 25 people in each meeting I think is a real good group. We all want to see the street better. Henry I know we've had some discussions about business owners, I guess I would suggest, get the group together with business owners, set a time. If you want speakers, we can also help you get speakers for the issues you are concerned about and I bet that most of the time we are going to be

in agreement. I just want to reaffirm that many of the people that really like the MiMo sidewalks, I don't want to get lost in the discussion, people had some concerns about durability and maintenance, my sense is that after it is explored, we are going to be ok. I noticed that Helen Scowfield, who has been around since 1915 has developed this particular material and they are too good a firm to let out a product that is not going to be properly maintained. I also wanted to say that I think that many of us think that Biscayne Blvd. can be a special place, MiMo is part of it, whether it is special sidewalks, lighting, incentives, but we all need to work together and have the City and Mr. Sarnoff, and I guess before you leave, makes sure that the City gives us the attention that we think that we deserve the street to get because we know we can make it a special place. And finally, Harry, I just want to really thank you because you brought in, disregarding for a second the issues with the trees and landscaping. You could have allowed the sidewalk to be anything but this was a consultant that got excited about Biscayne Blvd and had an idea that he thought would really help make it a special place. They came up with a concept, they schlep around to these meetings, they fight with FDOT and frankly at a time when we are really concerned with consultants and contractors with the City who don't care, frankly, this is someone who cared enough to come up with an original idea and think outside the box and that is the way that we all are going to have to be if we want to make Biscayne Boulevard as good as it can be.

Don Bailly

I am more concerned with maintenance (inaudible). Several weeks ago they cut several parking spots in front of my carpet store on 83rd St and Biscayne Blvd. which was fine. They showed me a replica of beautiful green grass (inaudible) palm trees, it was an absolute beauty. Six months after it was put in, the grass was weeds the palms fell across the telephone wires, my brother who is here tonight, helped to take it down (inaudible). When they cut the weeds, the debris falls on the sidewalk My warehouse man comes out and sweeps it off. So, I am just concern with the maintenance factor. I'd like to talk longer but at my age the doctor makes me drink a big glass of prune juice every night so, I got to go.

Daniel Bjaroff

I'll make this short and sweet. (Inaudible) one of my biggest concerns is also the maintenance. (Inaudible) in Miami Beach we've got buildings pretty much after (inaudible), within 2 or 3 years all plants are dead. Five to six to six years later they just leave them standing with all (inaudible) that is just grass patching out becomes (inaudible). What I want to make sure is, what you said about maintenance really really scares me. Buying \$200 heathers (inaudible) When I see the guy in the middle of the street, in the middle of Collins Avenue with this long sticks standing in the middle of the road like sowing down these palm trees, which obviously they are not going to trim them properly. So what I want to ask for is make sure that we get the best quality maintenance. I think is worth paying for. If you come down Miami Beach you notice in difference in Bal Harbor's landscaping, it always looks right, all the palm trees are cut properly. In Miami Beach half of the trees grow and when they fall down maintenance just comes and picks it up after they've been down for a week (inaudible) In Fort Myers they have a lot of the palms and the City (inaudible) every Monday (inaudible) and watches one section where owners take their time and accumulate the palms trees and the City comes by and only picks up the palms. I think once you have this whole corridor of palms you see that (inaudible). And the last thing I'd like to say is, if we end up with a concrete Boulevard likes it looks we are going to get, lets bring in the arts. Lets bring in sculptures,

you know those benches that a long time ago Coconut Grove exhibited, they had some artists rendered bus benches and park benches and the designers came up with these steel sculptures and I think we can have the benches and the sculptures and just incorporate that, just incorporate the arts into our concrete Boulevard. That's it.

Steve Hagen

First of all, Craig James may not know it but (inaudible) advisory board and I believe you are responsible for the landscaping along I-95, right, all the entrance and exits ramps, that's the man behind that. As chair of the Parks and Public Space Committee I learned that public process can be messy and I learned that history is important and I am glad that we learned the history about palm trees around Biscayne Blvd. because earlier on I was buying on the idea of the shades but I was envisioning shade trees like we have in Coral Way, something like that, bringing 20 year old trees but that can't happen, so when you look at reality and then you look at the history of what we had here, I just did some math, and I don't know, (inaudible) I think our goal ought to be to have a goal of at least two palms on each side of the street for each block and then we want to get shade trees or whatever. I mean that will get us back to roughly 75 trees that we were talking about. And the next thing is I have to ask question for clarification. Is it 6 foot you need between a tree or what is the designation?

Craig: You need 6 foot of unobstructed sidewalk. The minimum clearance for ADA is 36" at one given point. It cannot be 36" for a continuous length. The narrowest point had to be at a single point and not at a continuous length. The concept is to allow two wheel chairs to pass each other throughout a continuous length, however, if there has to be an obstruction such as a fire hydrant that have to be there, then you can narrow it down to 36" at one point so that one wheel chair can pass at a time. That is the concept behind it however, the rest of the corridor needs to wide enough for two wheel chairs. There is a minimum distance that is required between the restricted points, I don't have the number out of the top of my head but I think is 24 feet apart between each narrow point. It could be a tree or a shrubbed area but it has to be spaced a certain number of feet apart.

Steve Hagen: (inaudible) When they were talking about the concept you see in Miami Shores and in some other places when you have a (inaudible) lets say of 18 inch (inaudible) So if you have a restaurant it makes it more pedestrian friendly (inaudible). So the next question is, I would urge you that instead of us doing a standard 4 foot or 5 foot cut out or whatever for a palm tree that make a cut out that is rectangular where you have the palm tree at the center on one end leave some space for some shrubs or something that is hearty .

Craig: I appreciate your input in that. The direction we received earlier on was to have wide sidewalks. From 87 to 36 the Department of Transportation was directed by the (inaudible) including the City of Miami Planning Department to have wide sidewalks. So, if there is a desire to change that direction, that is what the commissioner needs to come back to FDOT tomorrow because this sidewalks are been built.

Steve Hagen: But we are not talking about he sidewalks, we are talking about the cut outs.

Craig: We may increase the cut outs, it may have an impact on our budget for the landscape project and the more removal of concrete we do, the less trees we may be able to get in the ground. At this point it will affect our budget. Now, that is not to say that this cannot be a continued effort. For example, we just don't have the trees there now with this project but as times goes on the community requests additional funding for grants to do other treatments that are contingent, including the decorative treatments on

sidewalks, maybe at that time we may remove the additional concrete. So I am just cautioning you to be careful, the more concrete we remove in this project would potentially reduce the number of trees.

Hagen: (inaudible)

Craig: Actually, in the final design if we go with this MiMo design it will be planters

Hagen: (inaudible) the City must sign a maintenance agreement and get a lot of the thing that you request. At this point the City is not willing to do that. Did you hear that folks (inaudible)

Craig: Let me be very clear, the City has agree to do maintenance however not to that level that you are talking about now, ground covered shrubs which raise the question of irrigation like we discussed earlier. All f these thing have to have a maintenance agreement. As of today, the City has agreed to maintain the trees. So now we are starting to talk about having additional materials, such as irrigation, shrubs, ground covers and the list can go on an on as we say earlier. All of these items would have to be included under that maintenance agreement.

Is there is anybody else that would like to make any comments?

Person from the audience: What are the sizes of the trees going to be? I am in the landscape business and I have certain requirements that I have to meet with the City and the State when I plant trees on the job site specially when it is in the median or in the right of way and it is suppose to be something like six inches around and 4 feet off the ground, are you guys going with that or are you going to put larger trees. AD Andrews in north Florida will send you down a 40 foot oak tree that will amount to \$600 and up so, you can have significant size oak trees brought down from north Florida in a flat bed. If you want me to make those arrangements I can do that, but whatever, then you have (inaudible) tree , so I mean, I don't know, what is the design thing for that.

Craig:

There is not a requirement for minimum size of tree however, we can install larger trees, yes, and in this case we have budget as with the current design, something like a 4 inch (inaudible) that will be about 20 foot tree , a 20 foot tree is going to be more like 8 feet wide. When it comes to oaks, yes you can get them

Henry Patel:

I just have a general comment. I know many people left but we had two days meetings and you know with all due respect my friend, Frank bought up a very important thing, when there is a group of committee we are divided on many things we get the rear end of the stick like this, that is not their fault, it is our fault because so many different groups have so many different agendas, and a lot of people left, but we need a united voice, including the businesses. And this requires some efforts made, and the responsibility is with (inaudible) and the Upper Eastside Miami Council but that is very likely something are flown by us without notice because we don't agree on common grounds on many things. Not in a negative way but what we need is more coordination and understanding I mean communication between the groups of people because of the things came on and we have no clue how they happened. And again, if we are talking now about putting pipes, that is going to delay , so I get nervous, I will have to get a blood pressure tablet because my motel is going to get hurt if the construction is going to get delayed. By the way, I am going to sit down and I appreciate our State Rep. staying late because once I made a comment and I supported Phillip Brutus and I never saw his face again. And I appreciate your presence

and in this issue we'll communicate if you cannot be here all the time because when it comes to DOT Marc Sarnoff will probably have to contact him too if you don't get things done. So, thank you very much.

Person from the audience: (inaudible) does it have to be with the City or does it have to be with the Chamber of Commerce?

Craig: Has to be with the local government or agency. Often times in cases like that Steve, interested parties, the City enters in an agreement with the Department of Transportation as well as entering into another agreement with the local entity that the DOT (inaudible)

Someone from audience: I have a very quick question. Does the City of Miami Tree Ordinance apply to plantings on a State Road?

Craig: Does not apply in an authoritative manner but the Department of Transportation tries to respect City Ordinances regarding to that however they do not supersede State law.

From audience: For example, the size of tree that were planted on 36 Street were very small, they will not meet the City's tree ordinance. Is that something that because is a State Road, is an FDOT project they will put smaller trees than the City requires?

Craig: That is not the case at all. Is not the point. The Department of Transportation is not interested in putting small trees to upset the community. The purpose of small trees or the reason why the small trees are put in on 36 Street was because the sidewalks are extremely narrow and the tree grates that are install in the sidewalks around those trees are not even a full grate, they are probably half a grate, they are very small grates. Those grates are meeting ADA requirements. The sidewalks were not wide enough to put in normal size trees. It is not our interest to put small trees, we are not trying to save dollars, it is based on safety and other ADA type of things.

From audience: My other question is, I'd really like to talk a little bit about the sidewalks, Is that going to be also done onto the southern side of the project or only from here up?

Craig: Once again, please let me clarify. The decorative treatments that you see presented tonight are only a concept and most likely will not be installed at this time but we wanted to at least presented to the community to show you that we are listening to your input, we are trying to come up with the design, the City Planning Department who has helped design charrettes here in the community, which apparently sounds like some of you all were not at those meetings but I can tell you they did occurred. The City's Planning Department did try to receive input from the community. If you all know what a design charrettes is. Is when you sit around and draw plans like these, so at that time the City did request that we consider decorative treatments on the sidewalk, however, we could not come to an agreement about the maintenance of these decorative treatments. Therefore, we want to at least present to you that we are receiving your input. We understand that you would like to have decorative treatments but the Department of Transportation will not maintain those decorative treatments. If I can just give you an example quickly of what I mean, is not the ware and tare of the material itself that is really the issue, in this particular material that we are looking here tonight, we need a sealer put on periodically to maintain

the life of this product. That is one issue. The other issue is what occurs when a break in the sidewalk occurs whenever that may be. An example of that is when a water meter needs to be put in by WASAD, when WASAD comes in and tears off the sidewalk and puts in that water meter, is anybody going to be responsible to restore the decorative treatment to that sidewalk. The Department of Transportation will not be responsible up keeping that kind of decorative treatment.

Person from the audience: The City already has an Ordinance that speaks of that and says that if there is a (inaudible) standard treatment, is called, and any agency or private contractor comes and insures that they will put it back like it was before. What happens is, we allow the governmental agencies to escape on that and we hold the private developer into doing it . If you go along River Drive , by the pumping station and you see where that was all torn up by WASAD and you had all those pavers going across the road, they had guts, they put back asphalt and the City just turn their head the other way and let it go, but there are ordinances on the books that, if WASAD came in and did (inaudible) put in meters because they were developers, they will be required to put that sidewalk back and put that appliqué design back on the sidewalk to pass their final inspection . Somebody just has to enforce it. There are a lot of things that are on the books that nobody enforces. The big question is, is the City willing to go forward with this and the overall maintenance and my gut feeling is they wouldn't. because they don't have the money to maintain it .

Craig: I can tell you clearly, the City of Miami has informed us that don't have the maintenance funds to maintain it at this point. They are already having to incur additional maintenance cost just for the landscaping alone. So therefore, when we try to discuss additional treatments such as sidewalk decorative treatments at this point we have been informed that they are not going to take on the additional maintenance cost.

Marta Rodriguez: We thank you for been her with us tonight and we also like to thank the City of Miami and the staff of Legion Park for letting us use their facility. Thanks for coming once again. Good night.